

# Political Communication: Deliberation

## POLS 418

### MWF 10:00-10:50

Drew Seib

February 25, 2011

## Before we get started...

- ▶ For next week read:
  - ▶ Kaid Ch9, Baum
  - ▶ Jamison (2006)
  - ▶ Kaid Ch 10)
  
- ▶ Micro-Paper 2

## Before we get started...

- ▶ For next week read:
  - ▶ Kaid Ch9, Baum
  - ▶ Jamison (2006)
  - ▶ Kaid Ch 10)
- ▶ Midterm?
- ▶ Micro-Paper 2

## Before we get started...

- ▶ For next week read:
  - ▶ Kaid Ch9, Baum
  - ▶ Jamison (2006)
  - ▶ Kaid Ch 10)
- ▶ Midterm?
- ▶ Micro-Paper 2

## Before we get started...

- ▶ For next week read:
  - ▶ Kaid Ch9, Baum
  - ▶ Jamison (2006)
  - ▶ Kaid Ch 10)
- ▶ Midterm?
- ▶ Micro-Paper 2
- ▶ News

# Goals

- ▶ Dialogue
- ▶ Michigan and Rochester Schools
- ▶ A Model of dialogue
- ▶ The evidence

## Exploring the Theories

- ▶ General reactions to chapters 1-3.

## Exploring the Theories

- ▶ General reactions to chapters 1-3.
- ▶ “The discussion found in political campaigns tends to impair the judgement of the electorate and to upset the formulation of coherent public policies” (Simon, p. 8).



## Exploring the Theories

- ▶ General reactions to chapters 1-3.
- ▶ “The discussion found in political campaigns tends to impair the judgement of the electorate and to upset the formulation of coherent public policies” (Simon, p. 8).
  - ▶ Is this a fair characterization of political campaigns?

# Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).
- ▶ Is dialogue a reasonable standard with which to evaluate campaigns?

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).
- ▶ Is dialogue a reasonable standard with which to evaluate campaigns?
- ▶ Using dialogue as a yardstick, how would you grade campaigns?

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).
- ▶ Is dialogue a reasonable standard with which to evaluate campaigns?
- ▶ Using dialogue as a yardstick, how would you grade campaigns?
- ▶ Simon makes special note of Fishkin’s distinction between a simple majority and a deliberative majority. How can you distinguish these two concepts?

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).
- ▶ Is dialogue a reasonable standard with which to evaluate campaigns?
- ▶ Using dialogue as a yardstick, how would you grade campaigns?
- ▶ Simon makes special note of Fishkin’s distinction between a simple majority and a deliberative majority. How can you distinguish these two concepts?
  - ▶ Do you agree with the notion that only a deliberative majority and not a simple majority can guarantee a policy’s legitimacy?

## Concepts

- ▶ What is dialogue?
  - ▶ “Simply put dialogue means that when one candidate raises a subject, his or her opponent responds by discussing the same subject” (Simon, p. 1).
- ▶ Is dialogue a reasonable standard with which to evaluate campaigns?
- ▶ Using dialogue as a yardstick, how would you grade campaigns?
- ▶ Simon makes special note of Fishkin’s distinction between a simple majority and a deliberative majority. How can you distinguish these two concepts?
  - ▶ Do you agree with the notion that only a deliberative majority and not a simple majority can guarantee a policy’s legitimacy?
- ▶ Deliberative polling.



## Campaigns as a Game

- ▶ How are electoral campaigns akin to games?

## Campaigns as a Game

- ▶ How are electoral campaigns akin to games?
- ▶ Under the gaming metaphor, how is politics at odds with the polity or is it?

## Campaigns as a Game

- ▶ How are electoral campaigns akin to games?
- ▶ Under the gaming metaphor, how is politics at odds with the polity or is it?
- ▶ Does viewing a political campaign as a conversation mitigate these negative conditions?

## Campaigns as a Game

- ▶ How are electoral campaigns akin to games?
- ▶ Under the gaming metaphor, how is politics at odds with the polity or is it?
- ▶ Does viewing a political campaign as a conversation mitigate these negative conditions?
- ▶ The game metaphor is analogous a zero sum game. One candidate wins and one candidate loses, in absolute terms. Is this the case under the conversation analogy?

## From Michigan to Rochester

- ▶ What are the Michigan and Rochester Schools?

## From Michigan to Rochester

- ▶ What are the Michigan and Rochester Schools?
- ▶ What do these two schools have to do with Simon's argument on deliberation?

# Model Assumptions

- ▶ Candidate Rationality
- ▶ Voting Behavior
- ▶ Multidimensionality
- ▶ Fixed Candidate Positions

# Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming



## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).

## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).
- ▶ Learning/Opinionation

## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).
- ▶ Learning/Opinionation
  - ▶ “A change in voter’s knowledge of the candidates’ positions” (p. 54).

## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).
- ▶ Learning/Opinionation
  - ▶ “A change in voter’s knowledge of the candidates’ positions” (p. 54).
- ▶ Direct Persuasion

## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).
- ▶ Learning/Opinionation
  - ▶ “A change in voter’s knowledge of the candidates’ positions” (p. 54).
- ▶ Direct Persuasion
  - ▶ At the individual level, persuasion is “the power of campaign messages to alter voter’s ideal points” (p. 55).

## Possible Campaign Effects

- ▶ Priming
  - ▶ “The weighting of considerations in a given decision” (p. 51).
- ▶ Learning/Opinionation
  - ▶ “A change in voter’s knowledge of the candidates’ positions” (p. 54).
- ▶ Direct Persuasion
  - ▶ At the individual level, persuasion is “the power of campaign messages to alter voter’s ideal points” (p. 55).
  - ▶ At the aggregate level, “persuasion refers to the ability of the campaign to move the position of the median voter relative to those of the candidates...” (p. 55).

## One Ad Experiment

- ▶ What is Simon's one ad design?

## One Ad Experiment

- ▶ What is Simon's one ad design?
- ▶ Why use a one ad design?



## One Ad Experiment

- ▶ What is Simon's one ad design?
- ▶ Why use a one ad design?
- ▶ What do the results of Simon's one ad experiment tell us about campaign and voting behavior?

## One Ad Experiment

- ▶ What is Simon's one ad design?
- ▶ Why use a one ad design?
- ▶ What do the results of Simon's one ad experiment tell us about campaign and voting behavior?
  - ▶ The presence of a political ad by Wilson primed subjects with respect to the vote

## One Ad Experiment

- ▶ What is Simon's one ad design?
- ▶ Why use a one ad design?
- ▶ What do the results of Simon's one ad experiment tell us about campaign and voting behavior?
  - ▶ The presence of a political ad by Wilson primed subjects with respect to the vote
  - ▶ Subjects who say Wilson's ad were more likely to be able to express about where Wilson stands on crime.

## Duck or Punch Results

Table: Table 5.1 from Simon(2002)-Dialogue

Condition	First Ad	Second Ad	Mean Vote
Dialogue	Wilson crime	Brown crime	-.13
Ignore	Wilson crime	Brown economy	.00
Ignore	Wilson crime	Brown education	.02
Dialogue	Brown economy	Wilson economy	.26
Ignore	Brown economy	Wilson crime	.05
Ignore	Brown economy	Wilson immigration	-.05
Dialogue	Brown education	Wilson education	.09
Ignore	Brown education	Wilson crime	-.13
Ignore	Brown education	Wilson immigration	.09

## Duck or Punch Results

Table: Table 5.2 from Simon(2002)-Innoculation

Condition	First Ad	Second Ad	Mean Vote
Don't	Brown education	Brown education	.14
Innoculate	Brown education	Brown crime	.00
Don't	Brown economy	Brown economy	.36
Innoculate	Brown economy	Brown crime economy	.09
Don't	Wilson crime	Wilson crime	.00
Innoculate	Wilson crime	Wilson economy	.14
Don't	Wilson immigration	Wilson immigration	-.05
Innoculate	Wilson Immigration	Wilson economy	-.00

## Re-examining the California election

- ▶ Did Brown have to lose?
- ▶ What could Brown have done to win?

# When Is Dialogue Most Likely To Occur

## When Is Dialogue Most Likely To Occur

- ▶ Editorial Policy
- ▶ Dimension Type (Owned and Critical)
- ▶ Certainty of Victory
- ▶ Candidate positions (how far apart the candidates are on an issue scale)